

# AIDS and the Duesberg Phenomenon

*by*Clyde Freeman Herreid
Department of Biological Sciences
University at Buffalo, State University of New York

## Part I

The scientific community has been alternately challenged, irritated, frustrated, and bemused by Dr. Peter Duesberg of the University of California at Berkeley and his position on AIDS. Duesberg, a renowned virologist and a member of the prestigious National Academy of Science, does not believe that HIV causes AIDS. Rather, he claims that AIDS is the result of recreational and anti-HIV drugs. Virtually all scientists who have studied the issue believe Duesberg's opinions to be extreme, although some maintain that HIV is not the sole cause of AIDS.

# Your Assignment

- 1. Read the following papers published in *Science* as well as the authors' respective rebuttals:
  - Duesberg, P. 1988. HIV is Not the Cause of AIDS. Science 241(4865): 514.
  - Blattner and Colleagues Respond to Duesberg. Science 241 (4865): 514 & 517.
  - Blattner, W., R.C. Gallo, and H.M. Temin. 1988. HIV Causes AIDS. Science 241(4865): 515.
  - Duesberg's Response to Blattner and Colleagues. Science 241 (4865): 515-516.
- 2. In your groups, identify the issues or questions that are important in these papers, as well any terms, concepts, and information you need to understand in order to resolve those issues or questions. Divide up the workload and use the library, Internet, and your textbooks to find answers.

### Part II

- 1. After sharing the information you collected with the other members of your group, read the following papers:
  - Duesberg, P. 1991. AIDS Epidemiology: Inconsistencies with Human Immunodeficiency Virus and with Infectious Disease. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Science* 88: 1575–1579.
  - Moore, J. 1996. A Duesberg Adieu! Nature 380: 293-294.
  - Nowak, M.A., and A.J. McMichael. 1995. How HIV Defeats the Immune System. *Scientific American* Aug. 1995: 58–65.
- 2. Again, as a group, identify any terms, concepts, and information you need to understand in order to resolve the issue. Divide up the workload and use the library, Internet, and your textbooks to find your answers.

### Part III

Now that you have become experts on the topic, your assignment is to evaluate the nine points that Duesberg made in his original *Science* article where he claimed that "HIV is not the cause of AIDS because it fails to meet the postulates of Koch and Henle, as well as six cardinal rules of virology." In class, as a group, write a brief summary of each of the nine points in light of the information you have collected.

Case copyright held by the **National Center for Case Study Teaching in Science**, University at Buffalo, State University of New York. Originally published October 6, 1999. Please see our **usage guidelines**, which outline our policy concerning permissible reproduction of this work.