**Table 2.** Rubric to evaluate student learning. (Based upon a Claim-Evidence-Reasoning rubric used by Ms. Duchon’s school system; reference added after blind review).

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Criterion** | **Level** |
| **0** | **1 (Basic)** | **2 (Proficient)** | **3 (Advanced)** |
| **Claim 1**: Identification of Fence that Would Allow Henrietta to Escape | No response or does not make a claim.\*\* | Makes an inaccurate claim: *Incorrectly identifies Fence 2\* or identifies both fences.\*\** | N/A | Makes an accurate claim: *Correctly identifies Fence 1\**. |
| **Evidence 1**:Reason for Fence Allowing Henrietta to Escape | No response or does not provide evidence. | Provides evidence that does not support the claim. | Provides some evidence that supports the claim:*States that the foam blocks are the reason that Henrietta can escape, but does not provide additional evidence*. | Provides all evidence that supports the claim:*States that Henrietta can move the foam blocks because they are lighter or easier to move.* |
| **Claim 2:**Identification of Fence that Would Keep Henrietta In | No response or does not make a claim.\*\* | Makes an inaccurate claim: *Incorrectly identifies Fence 1\*, or identifies both fences.\*\** | N/A | Makes an accurate claim: *Correctly identifies Fence 2\**. |
| **Evidence 2:**Reason for Fence to Keep Henrietta In | No response or does not provide evidence. | Provides evidence that does not support the claim. | Provides some evidence that supports the claim:*States that the wooden blocks are the reason that Henrietta stays in, but does not provide additional evidence*. | Provides all evidence that supports the claim:*States that Henrietta cannot move the wooden blocks (or that the wooden blocks keep Henrietta in) because they are heavier.* |

\* Reminder: Fence 1 allows Henrietta to escape; Fence 2 is able to contain Henrietta.

\*\* If a student makes an inaccurate claim (0 or 1), then s/he may either earn a 0 or 1 for evidence.